



SEMINAR SERIES

Entangled Histories of Emotions in the Mediterranean World



THE UNIVERSITY OF
WESTERN AUSTRALIA



Consolato d'Italia

Perth



Entangled Histories of Things in the Mediterranean World

Date: 14 December 2017

Venue: Irwin Street Building (G11),
Convocation Council Room,
The University of Western Australia
(UWA)

Convenors: Giovanni Tarantino,
Susanne Meurer and Arvi Wattel
(UWA)

Free event but booking essential.

RSVP by Thursday 7 December
emotions@uwa.edu.au

This workshop will have a particular focus on the interactions of subject, material and emotional formations, applying a 'new materialities' analytical paradigm to examine the entangled trajectories, transmissions and transfers of people, ideas and objects across Mediterranean spaces. It thus advances research on the interconnected histories of people, places and things in circulation in the Mediterranean world over a long historical timeframe. The workshop seeks to apply new methodological lenses to the complex and entangled history of the geo-cultural space of the Mediterranean World. These new analytical frameworks demand that we consider people, places and things as having entangled subjective, affective, emotional and material lives that are mutually constitutive. As such, these theories suggest that we cannot study individuals and societies outside of their interactions with material entities such as spaces and places and affective experiences, but only in relation to them – and likewise, spaces, objects and emotional experience as relational constructs produced through interactions with people. Thus, people, places and things are 'entangled'.

Image: Johannes (or Johann) Lingelbach, *Harbour on the Mediterranean* (1670), Royal Picture Gallery Mauritshuis, The Hague. This is a faithful photographic reproduction of a two-dimensional, public domain work of art.



Institute of Advanced Studies



Acknowledgments

This seminar is held under the patronage of the Consulate of Italy in Perth and hosted by the Institute of Advanced Studies at The University of Western Australia (UWA). It is a joint initiative of the Society for the History of Emotions, the Australian Research Council Centre of Excellence for the History of Emotions, Europe 1100–1800 (CHE), the UWA School of Design, the Italian National Research Council Institute for the History of Philosophical and Scientific Thought in the Modern Age (CNR/ISPF), the Chair of Intellectual History at the European University Institute (EUI), the Institute for Advanced Study at Central European University (IAS-CEU), the Italian National Institute for Higher Mathematics (INdAM), and the Centre for the Study of Emotions in Cross-Cultural Exchange (ECCE, Zagreb).

EMOTIONS
MAKE
HISTORY



14 DECEMBER 2017

Irwin Street Building (G11), Convocation Council Room, The University of Western Australia (UWA)

9.00–9.10 REGISTRATION AND COFFEE

9.10–9.30 Opening greetings:
Andrew Lynch (UWA)
Giovanni Tarantino (UWA)

SESSION 1 Chair: Alistair Paterson (UWA)

- 9.30–11.00am
- Antigoni Zournatzi (National Hellenic Research Foundation, Athens Greece), 'Looking Beyond Stereotypes: Greek Responses to Persia, c.550–c.330BC'
 - Lauren Jacobi (Massachusetts Institute of Technology), 'Emotional Geography: The Sea as Territorial Place in Early Modern Europe'
 - Respondent: Giovanni Tarantino (UWA)

11.00–11.30 COFFEE BREAK

SESSION 2 Chair: Susanne Meurer (UWA)

- 11.30–13.00
- Stefano Carboni (The Art Gallery of Western Australia), 'Transfer of Glass Technology, Raw Material and Ideas Across the Mediterranean'
 - Roger Benjamin (The University of Sydney), 'Double Crossings: Diplomacy and the Picturesque at the Strait of Gibraltar'
 - Respondent: Arvi Wattel (UWA)

13.00–14.00 LUNCH

SESSION 3 Chair: Katrina O'Loughlin (UWA)

- 14.00–15.30
- Jane-Héloïse Nancarrow (UWA), '*Normanitas* and Entangled Memorial Traditions in the Architecture of Frederick II'
 - Lisa Beaven (The University of Melbourne), 'Bezoar Stones and Rhinoceros Horns: Superstition as a Motivation for Collecting in Seventeenth-Century Rome'
 - Respondent: William M. Taylor (UWA)

15.30–16.00 COFFEE BREAK

ROUND TABLE Chair: John Kinder (UWA)

16.00–17.30 Daniel Barbu (CRASH/CNRS Paris), Louise D'Arcens (Macquarie University), Elizabeth Reid (UWA), Luisa Simonutti (CNR-ISPF, Milan), Charles Zika (The University of Melbourne)

Bezoar Stones and Rhinoceros Horns: Superstition as a Motivation for Collecting in Seventeenth-Century Rome

Lisa Beaven

(The University of Melbourne)

This paper explores the presence of a range of objects in elite collections in Rome in the seventeenth-century in the context of their value, meanings and global trajectories. From the late sixteenth-century onward trade within Europe increased in scale significantly, with many countries also importing large quantities of goods from further afield, along global trading routes. The conspicuous consumption of Roman elites resulted in the presence of a wide range of luxury goods and rare objects entering their collections. These ranged from textiles, gems, metalwork, Chinese porcelain and inlaid furniture to mummies and weaponry. For the purposes of this paper, however, I would like to concentrate on those objects which were collected for their protective qualities, and the emotional implications of these collecting choices. Many elite collections in Rome, for example, contained bezoar stones, nails of the 'Great Beast', rhinoceros horns and walrus tusks. These exotic objects were believed to offer protection from poison or illness, and some were worn on the body, or ground into a powder and drunk, or carved into drinking vessels. Very often such objects were to be found in *studiolos* along with religious objects of equal talismanic significance such as relics, small religious reliefs, statues and rosaries. Several collections contained models of the Holy Sepulchre, identical to extant examples that were made in Jerusalem in the seventeenth century for Italian markets and in themselves evidence of trade between the eastern and western Mediterranean at this time, and the endurance of pilgrimage routes to Jerusalem. Considered together, these sacred and secular objects in Roman collections suggest that superstition and even fear, were powerful motivations for collecting, and that such objects were granted considerable power and agency by their owners.

LISA BEAVEN is a postdoctoral research fellow with the ARC Centre of Excellence for the History of Emotions at The University of Melbourne. Her research interests are concentrated on seventeenth-century Italian art and material culture, landscape painting and digital mapping and religious emotion. She has published widely in journals such as the *Art Bulletin* and *The Burlington Magazine*, and in books such as *Possessions of a Cardinal* and *Art and Identity in Early Modern Rome*. Her book, *An Ardent Patron: Cardinal Camillo Massimo and his artistic and antiquarian circle: Claude Lorrain, Nicolas Poussin and Diego Velazquez*, was published by Paul Holberton Press, London and CEEH, Madrid in 2010. Her most recent publication (with Angela Hesson) is 'Objects of Love', a chapter in *Love: The Art of Emotion*, Melbourne: National Gallery of Victoria exhibition catalogue, 2017, pp.124–139.

Double Crossings: Diplomacy and the Picturesque at the Strait of Gibraltar

Roger Benjamin

(The University of Sydney)

This paper seeks to develop a visual history of the Strait of Gibraltar – nine miles of the most strategically contested water in the world – by comparing the entangled visual culture of its northern and southern ports: Tangier, the Muslim and international city at the tip of Africa, and Gibraltar, the fortress-peninsula at the southernmost point of Catholic Spain. A British possession from 1704, Gibraltar elicited much history painting during the Great Siege (1779–1783) and the Battle of Trafalgar (1805). In the peace following the Peninsular War (1807–1814) a less militarised vision of the region developed, stimulated by an emergent tourism to the Moorish monuments of Andalusia. Watercolour and pencil drawings were made to illustrate travel books, the key literary form for cross-cultural conceptions of the Mediterranean. The French landscapist/entrepreneur Isidore Taylor was the first, in 1827, to investigate both sides of the Strait, sailing from Gibraltar to Tangier and taking a horse to Tetuan, a day's ride east. All such artists relied on their home country's diplomats for security, local introductions and portrait commissions. Edward Drummond-Hay, a Scottish laird and British Consul from 1829 to 1844 (when he was succeeded by his Arabophone son John) led the international community of Tangier; Eugène Delacroix socialised with Hay (making a fine sketch portrait), even while Hispanophone Jewish families were his preferred models. David Roberts doubtless met Hay in 1833; his drawings of the African and Spanish coasts were published as lithographs in Roscoe's *Tourist in Spain and Morocco* (1838). Departing from earlier military topographies of place, Roberts evoked the geological sublime at Gibraltar, fixed the Moorish monuments of Tangier and invested mountainous Tetuan with an implausible grandeur suitable for a visual regime of tourism. Local types were less his focus than for J. F. Lewis, whose images of *contrabandistas* – common Romantic figures for the Mediterranean – animate the vicinity of Gibraltar in his *Sketches of Spain and Spanish Character* (1834). The play between visual 'regimes of intelligence' and 'regimes of tourism' distinguish such visual objects that made their way from Mediterranean shores to the publishing capitals of northern Europe.

ROGER BENJAMIN is an Australian art historian and curator trained in Melbourne, Bryn Mawr and Paris. He has written widely on French modernist art, French Orientalist painting and contemporary Aboriginal art. Benjamin's early publications include *Matisse's 'Notes of a Painter'* (Ann Arbor, 1985), and 'Matisse in Morocco: a Colonizing Esthetic?' (*Art in America*, 1990). In 1995 he co-curated a major Matisse retrospective for the Queensland Art Gallery. His exhibition catalogue *Orientalism: Delacroix to Klee* (Sydney, 1997) brings international Orientalism into the 1930s. His key book is *Orientalist Aesthetics: Art, Colonialism and French North Africa, 1880-1930* (Berkeley, 2003), for which Benjamin received the Robert Motherwell Book Award (New York). His *Renoir and Algeria* (2003) was organised for the Clark Art Institute before travelling to Dallas and Paris. Benjamin's books on contemporary Australian art include *Juan Davila* (2006) and *Icons of the Desert: Early Aboriginal Painting from Papunya* (2009). Benjamin has held teaching posts at The

University of Melbourne, Australian National University and The University of Sydney, where he was Power Professor (2003–2007), and remains a professor of Art History. Benjamin has held the DORA fellowship of the Australian Research Council (2013–2016). His ARC project, entitled “Orientalism of the Mediterranean Shore: Art and Place from Tunis to Marseille”, resulted in the book *Kandinsky and Klee in Tunisia* (University of California Press, 2015) and the exhibition *Biskra: sortilèges d'une oasis* (Institute du Monde Arabe, Paris; catalogue in French, 200pp). The Biskra exhibition is currently at the Musée Matisse, Nice.

Transfer of Glass Technology, Raw Material and Ideas Across the Mediterranean

Stefano Carboni (*The Art Gallery of Western Australia*)

Gregorio from Nauplia is a historical figure recorded in the Venetian archives for the first time in the spring of 1280, when he had his first encounter with the local authorities. From this source we learn that Gregorio was sued by a *fiolario* (maker of glass beakers) based on the island of Murano, Stefano Spandinoci, because they had an agreement that Stefano would provide Gregorio with a number of *mozoli schieti in vitrum blanchum* (plain, clear beakers) and he would decorate them with coloured enamels similarly to those wonderful gilded and enamelled glass vessels coming from the ‘lands of the Saracens’, which were so prized in Europe. Evidently Gregorio hadn’t honoured the agreement and ended up in prison for eight days. He later opened his own glass-painting workshop in Murano but in the course of his working life he was called as many as twenty-five times by the Podestà who warned him either to work or pay his creditors back.

This cautionary tale is an ideal start to apply a new materialities analytical paradigm to examine the entangled trajectories, transmissions and transfers of people, ideas and objects across Mediterranean spaces. The transfer of technology and raw materials for glassmaking from the Islamic Eastern Mediterranean regions to Venice is well documented over the centuries: it included both the trade in plant ashes (alkali) and broken glass or cullet, which had a significant economic impact on the growing Venetian industry. The impact for the history of emotions is manifest in individual stories that have been recorded in original sources and through the evidence of objects that found their way to Europe. One such example is an enamelled and gilded bottle brought from the Holy Land and deposited in the Treasury of St. Stephen in Vienna, which is supposedly filled with earth saturated with the blood of the Innocents.

STEFANO CARBONI was appointed Director of the Art Gallery of Western Australia in October 2008. Since then he has been instrumental in the successful completion of the \$25m TomorrowFund for the acquisition of contemporary art, for the reinstallation of the collections and for continuous exhibition partnerships with major international art museums. Previously he was Curator and Administrator in the Department of Islamic Art at The Metropolitan Museum of Art and Visiting Professor at the Bard Graduate Center in New York. At the Metropolitan Museum he was responsible for a large number of exhibitions, including the acclaimed *Venice and the Islamic World, 828-1797* (2006–2007). His publications include the prestigious Barr Award

winner *The Legacy of Genghis Khan. Courtly Arts and Culture in Western Asia, 1256-1353* (2002); and *Venice and the Islamic World, and The Wonders of Creation and Singularities of Painting. A Study of the Ilkhanid London Qazvini* (Edinburgh University Press, 2015). Stefano has taught courses in Islamic art and curatorial studies at the Institute of Fine Arts (NYU), Hunter College (CUNY) and the Bard Graduate Center for the Decorative Arts in New York. He has been appointed Adjunct Professor at The University of Western Australia and continues to lecture widely on Islamic art and curatorial studies. Stefano completed his graduate studies in Arabic and in Islamic Art at the University of Venice and his PhD in Islamic Art at the University of London.

Emotional Geography: The Sea as Territorial Place in Early Modern Europe

Lauren Jacobi (*Massachusetts Institute of Technology [MIT]*)

For scholars of early modernity, the application of spatial theory to historical analysis has gained widespread traction in recent years. Henri Lefebvre’s observations about how space is constituted by and generates social relations, as opposed to space being a backdrop on which people act, has fundamentally influenced the study of architecture and urban firmaments. Lefebvre’s ideas about space typically are applied to land-locked areas and often are used to distinguish between location, usually a specified set of latitude and longitude coordinates on a map, and place, which is to say locations that work to constitute social unity—or friction—through various mechanisms, including the symbolic and the imaginary. Significant emotional investments are imbricated in place, which is socially constructed. In this paper, I focus on how such ideas can be applied to places at sea, addressing in particular how notions of territory came to be applied to watery bodies. At stake is how water zones came to be designated as places that acted to strengthen (or weaken) emotional bonds between various stakeholders, including those brought together through ship travel. Drawing on the work of Barbara Rosenwein, the paper probes the emotional communities of those seafarers, merchants and pilgrims, banded together aboard ships, themselves objects used to inscribe territory. To use Rosenwein’s terms of query, what were the modes of emotional expression that such groups valued, encouraged, tolerated and deplored? Additionally, how did such sea-bound emotional communities delineate certain territories?

LAUREN JACOBI is the Class of 1942 Career Development Associate Professor of Architectural History at MIT. She is currently developing a project for publication about the *nomos* of the sea in which she studies how spatial practices extended to aquatic realms in the pre-industrial Mediterranean world, including how the spatial domain was defined through maritime jurisdiction. A scholar of early-industrial and early modern Europe, Jacobi has a book manuscript under contract with Cambridge University Press that probes historical relationships between banks and religious behavior, exploring urban geographies and architectural forms that unveil moral attitudes toward money during the birth of capitalism. She recently held a postdoctoral Rome Prize for Renaissance and Early Modern Studies at the American Academy in Rome. She received a MA from the Courtauld Institute and a doctorate from the Institute of Fine Arts, NYU with fellowships from the Kress Foundation, the Getty Research Institute, the Morgan Library and Museum, and the American Council of Learned Societies. Jacobi has published in *The Burlington Magazine* and *Tabula Quarterly*, and forthcoming essays will be published by Routledge and Cambridge University Press. She is former vice president of the New York Metropolitan chapter of the Society of Architectural Historians.

'Normanitas' and Entangled Memorial Traditions in the Architecture of Frederick II

Jane-Héloïse Nancarrow

(The University of Western Australia)

From 1225 to 1250, Holy Roman Emperor Frederick II built or renovated hundreds of structures across the southern Italian province of Apulia, blending a captivating range of classical Roman, Islamic or Byzantine architectural elements with the advent of Gothic style. Yet many of these architectural traits had already been adopted by the Norman lords of southern Italy in the preceding two centuries; thus we must consider Frederick's 'originality' in light of these entangled trends in the existing Mediterranean Romanesque canon. Indeed, Frederick's replication of Norman practices lay in their previous success as emotionally-resonant and meaning-laden tools of empire, and echoes his re-use of Roman remains often within the same architectural settings. This paper considers Frederician design and objects as multivalent points of cultural contact and exchange with the wider Mediterranean world – including the topographical layout and positioning of buildings within urban townscapes; the appropriation of portable Romanesque sculpture and other decorative arts; and the adoption of classical and Norman artistic and engineering practices. Exploring examples from Bari, Barletta, Gioia Del Colle and Lucera, we begin to understand that Frederician material heritage not only demonstrates processes of *spolia* and renovation, but more nuanced processes of innovation; expressed in the context of Frederick's cultural and political deference towards his Norman forebears.

JANE-HÉLOÏSE NANCARROW is an Honorary Research Fellow at The University of Western Australia and a 2016 Associate Investigator with the ARC Centre of Excellence for the History of Emotions. She received her doctorate from the University of York in 2014, which will be published as her forthcoming monograph 'The Roman Material Past in Anglo-Norman England' in 2018 (Boydell and Brewer). Her research focuses on digital visualisation and emotions for cultural heritage, *spolia* in cross-cultural contexts, and the legacy of Rome in the middle ages.

Looking Beyond Stereotypes: Greek Responses to Persia, c.550-c.330 BC

Antigoni Zournatzi *(National Hellenic Research Foundation)*

Ancient Greek encounters with the Achaemenid Persian empire left permanent traces in the annals of world history in the form of the well-known Greek-Persian military competition that was sealed with the battles of Marathon, Thermopylae, Salamis and Plataea, and later with the dissolution of the Persian empire by Alexander. Ancient Greek utterances, conveying feelings of Greek hostility towards Persia and sentiments of the superiority of Greek civilisation in comparison with the 'barbarian' Persian one, were responsible for a long-traditional perception of Greek-Persian encounters as a leading paradigm of East-West political, cultural and ideological distinctness and conflict. This presentation considers, on the one hand, the historical circumstances that gave rise to the negative stereotypes about the Persians reflected in the ancient Greek record. On the other hand, it seeks to offer vistas onto more recent developments towards an unbiased study of the two centuries long Greek-Persian cultural discourse, and to highlight the varied patterns of the Greeks' actual collective and private responses to Persia that can be reconstructed from the extant written and archaeological/iconographic testimony.

ANTIGONI ZOURNATZI is a Director of Research and Coordinator of 'The Hellenic World and the East' Program of the Antiquity Section of the Institute of Historical Research of the National Hellenic Research Foundation in Athens, Greece. She has studied ancient history and classical and Near Eastern archaeology (BA Classics/Classical Archaeology, Harvard-Radcliffe Colleges; PhD Near Eastern Studies, University of California at Berkeley). Her historical and archaeological research addresses interconnections of the Greek world with the Near East from the mid-first millennium BC through the mid-first millennium AD, as well as cross-cultural phenomena in archaic and classical Cyprus and the territories of the Achaemenid Empire.



SEMINAR SERIES

Entangled Histories of
Emotions in the
Mediterranean World

International Seminar Series

contact: giovanni.tarantino@uwa.edu.au

1 NAPLES, 26 June 2017

Società Nazionale di Scienze Lettere ed Arti

Cultures in Movement: New Visions, New Conceptual Paradigms

The category of Orientalism, understood as a product of Western authors, artists and the like, has been superseded, and so too has a unitary vision of the vast and complex Eastern world of the Near East. However, a conception that is no longer static but the fruit of historic, spatiotemporal and emotional transformations has yet to be adequately placed at the centre of the 'Mediterranean World' in a culturally broad sense. Such a view requires the testing of new paradigms and investigative methodologies, and of new conceptual tools. In this seminar, the point of observation will be reciprocal legacies, the transfer and translation-appropriation of knowledge, objects and goods, and migrations of bodies, ideas, visions and emotions – all of which have made the Mediterranean not a barrier but a point of contact between different and plural cultures.

2 SPLIT, 25 September 2017

Centre for the Study of Emotions in Cross-Cultural Exchange

Portals: Spaces of Encounter, Entanglement and Exchange

South East Europe is a key historical contact zone for the encounter of Continental, Mediterranean and Steppe cultures from the classical world, through the Middle Ages and early modern period. This history of cultural and emotional entanglement is inscribed in many of the region's geographical features: from the Adriatic to the Black Sea; the Danube – the main artery of the region – and connected inland waterways; the complex landscapes of mountains, coastal strips, islands, river mouths, ravines and fertile river plains. These distinctive landscapes have created natural and imaginary liminal zones: a series of fluid borderlines and cultural portals that criss-cross the South East. This seminar explores these sites of encounter, asking what role topography and landscape might play in the shaping of cultural portals of conflict and exchange. It considers the spaces and media through which these various cultures communicated with each other in South East Europe, in terms of cultural, commercial, artistic and emotional exchange; in periods of peace, and of confrontation. How is emotion used to calibrate cultural differences and exchanges between groups? And how might the historical geographies of encounter and exchange – and their attendant emotional entanglements – provide useful terms or models for the study of cultural experience and expression of emotion?

3 PERTH, 14 December 2017

The University of Western Australia

Entangled Histories of Things in the Mediterranean World

This workshop will have a particular focus on the interactions of subject, material and emotional formations, applying a 'new materialities' analytical paradigm to examine the entangled trajectories, transmissions and transfers of people, ideas and objects across Mediterranean spaces. It thus advances research on the interconnected histories of people, places and things in circulation in the Mediterranean world over a long historical timeframe, from the medieval to the present. The workshop seeks to apply new methodological lenses to the complex and entangled history of the geo-cultural space, the Mediterranean World. These new analytical frameworks demand that we consider people, places and things as having entangled subjective, affective, emotional and material lives that are mutually constitutive. As such, these theories suggest that we cannot study individuals and societies outside of their interactions with material entities such as spaces and places and affective experiences, but only in relation to them – and likewise, spaces, objects and emotional experience as relational constructs produced through interactions with people. Thus, people, places and things are 'entangled'.

4 FLORENCE, 5 February 2018

European University Institute

People in Movement: Mediterranean Encounters

This workshop will look at contacts between different cultures in the Mediterranean world. Possible subjects include the perceptions of other cultures, which involved emotions such as curiosity or fear; emotions expressed, for example, in travel accounts describing other cultures; peoples and 'races', and also in their translations. A particularly interesting aspect of these intertwined cultures concerns the activities of Mediterranean 'pirates' and those taken captive – both Europeans held for ransom in North Africa, and North Africans forced to work as galley slaves in European countries – and the accounts of the sufferings of Christian 'slaves' in Barbary. Another fruitful path to explore involves a new approach to the activities of diplomats or merchants through the study of the emotions expressed in their memoirs or correspondence.

5 BUDAPEST, 18 June 2018

Central European University, Institute for Advanced Study

Religious Sentiments Across Central and Eastern Europe

This workshop will look specifically at the relations between religion, religious sentiments and emotions across Central and Eastern Europe, Southeastern Europe and the Eastern Arab Mediterranean. The workshop will integrate two perspectives in terms of contact zones, by relating cross-imperial boundaries, contacts and transfers as well as religious boundaries within given multi-confessional societies. The central question will be what role religion played in shaping emotions and repertoires of emotion and perceptions thereof, including how to make sense of irrational emotions. How are similarities and differences of regimes of body language and emotional registers and economy explained in religious terms? How are religious traditions and formation in multi-confessional contexts inscribed in non-religious practices? When do such perceptions change and how do we as historians measure such change? To this end, the workshop will address issues of methodology and historical case studies, in which Islam will play a special, though not exclusive role. Methodologically, the focus will be on the tangibility or otherwise of religious sentiments in given materials and practices (Muslim, Jewish, Orthodox, Catholic, and rejections thereof). As for empirical studies, the workshop will focus on case studies involving the complex relationship of body, religious practice and emotion, including sentiments disavowing the impact of religion on the economy of emotion and religious sentiments.



Consolato d'Italia
Perth

